CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
Ben Rosenfield
Controller
Monique Zmuda
Deputy Controller

MEMORANDUM

GOVERNMENT
DOCUMENTS DEPT
JUN 15 2010
SAN FRANCISCO
PUBLIC LIBRARY

TO: Mayor Gavin Newsom; Members of the Board of Supervisors

FROM: Ben Rosenfield, Controller
M. Catherine McGuire, Project Manager

DATE: June 14, 2010

SUBJECT: Civilianization in the San Francisco Police Department – Patrol, Investigations, and Continued Support Functions

Charter Section 16.123 directs the Controller and Chief of Police to identify positions in the San Francisco Police Department (SFPD) that could be filled appropriately by civilian personnel. This memo provides background information on the progress of civilianization in the SFPD and includes new analysis and recommendations to civilianize additional functions.

The Controller's Office conducted an analysis of the use of civilians to respond to non-hazardous calls for service and to assist investigators with casework. We also reviewed the progress of civilianization generally in the SFPD and made additional civilianization recommendations. The following table provides a summary of the recommendations contained in this memo.

Summary of Previous Civilianization and Current Recommendations

	Previously Civilianized	Additional Recommendations	**Totals**
Patrol and Investigations Functions	0	39	**39**
Support Functions	77	212	**289**
Totals	**77**	**251**	**328**

Civilian Use in Patrol and Investigative Functions

Use of Civilians in Other Jurisdictions

Jurisdictional comparisons show that Police Departments incorporate civilians into their support functions first, in positions such as clerical staff, dispatchers, information systems management, financial management, human resources management, vehicle maintenance, and forensic evidence collection and analysis. SFPD has made significant progress in including civilians into those functions.

As departments progress, they utilize civilians more by integrating them into patrol and investigations functions, representing a shift to a more thorough use of civilians and more effective use of sworn personnel for the work for which they are best suited. SFPD can utilize civilians to respond to low-risk calls for service, conduct initial reviews of cases, write reports, and prepare case files.

Examples of the use of civilians in patrol and investigative functions in other jurisdictions are:

- Petaluma, California uses civilian "Community Service Officers" to conduct both patrol and investigative functions, such as:
  - Conducting work such as responding to time-consuming, non-hazardous calls, handling abandoned vehicles, and providing traffic control for emergencies and accidents.
  - Investigating non-suspect police reports, conducting background checks on offenders, and photographing and fingerprinting individuals.
- Great Falls, Montana also has "Community Services Officers", which are civilian employees who primarily work on motor vehicle collisions, including investigation, writing reports and other documentation, and providing courtroom testimony.
- Kentucky allows jurisdictions to hire two types of civilian positions granting minimal enforcement authority such as issuing citations for non-moving vehicular violations and for citation of misdemeanor criminal offenses.

Civilian Use in SFPD Patrol Functions

By examining calls for service data, it is possible to determine the workload in SFPD's patrol function that could be handled by civilians. The Controller's Office conducted an analysis that calculated the time spent on these types of non-hazardous calls in order to estimate the number of civilians needed. Non-hazardous calls are considered those that have no suspect at the location and include such calls as burglary, robbery, petty theft, fraud, and missing persons. Calculations of time spent on these calls included:

- Time spent interacting with community members at the scene of an incident.
- Time spent interacting with community members who come into a station to report an incident.
- Time spent writing reports for these incidents.
- An estimate of time spent on calls in which the request for service was cancelled.[1]

For these calls, civilians would go to non-hazardous crime scenes to take a report from a victim and write the reports. This analysis shows that the equivalent of 16 full-time civilian positions would be able to handle this workload Citywide. These results, including total time spent on non-hazardous calls for service by call type, are shown in Attachment A.

In addition to the potential reduction of over 500 cancelled calls, the Controller's Office anticipates a reduction in wait times for all types of calls. Currently, the average time elapsed between the time a call taker picks up a call and the time an officer arrives (wait time) is 56 minutes for the types of calls analyzed. The maximum wait time among these calls was approximately eight hours. Average wait times by call type are shown in Attachment B.

Civilian Use in SFPD Investigations Functions

Investigations tasks are included in the above examples of civilian use in other jurisdictions. SFPD has a new case assignment model at the districts in which all cases are being assigned to an investigator. Under this model, a civilian would be well-suited to conduct initial investigations for those reports that have no suspects and be able to make recommendations where patterns arise.

In addition, a national independent consulting firm[2] recommended that SFPD investigators distinguish the tasks that do not require sworn status and assign them to a new civilian class. Such tasks included preparing

[1] Cancelled calls are cancelled by the person requesting the service due to lengthy response times. The Controller's Office assumed that response times for these calls would drop, potentially eliminating many cancelled calls, and requiring an estimate of time that would be spent on these calls if they were not cancelled.

[2] Police Executive Research Forum. "Organizational Assessment of the San Francisco Police Department: A Technical Report." 2008. pp 139-142.

3 1223 08817 4025

case files, conducting phone interviews, scheduling interviews for investigators, coordinating crime lab requests and results, researching incidents and criminal codes, preparing photo line-ups, and maintaining accurate clearance files. None of these tasks require sworn status and would allow investigators to focus on the tasks that do require sworn status. This work is estimated to be the equivalent of 23 civilian positions, with approximately 13 of these positions staying in the Investigations Division and 10 assisting investigators assigned to District Stations.

SFPD Civilianization Progress and Additional Recommendations

In addition to new uses of civilians in patrol and investigation functions, SFPD can continue to civilianize its support functions, such as forensic evidence collection and analysis and information systems management. Attachment C provides a summary of the above recommendations, an update of the status of previously recommended positions for civilianization, and new recommendations for civilianization. A description of the previously and currently recommended civilianization efforts is below.

Beginning in Fiscal Year 2004-05, SFPD (in partnership with the Controller's Office) identified 123 positions appropriate for civilianization. These positions represent civilian managers of major support functions, clerk/typists in Records Management, legal assistants, storekeepers for Property Control, information systems engineers and administrators, and auto service workers. The Controller's Office recommends that SFPD continue its efforts to civilianize support functions in the Department by fully civilianizing the CompStat Division, the Forensic Services Division, the Permits and Property Units of Support Services, and the Technology Division. In addition, SFPD should work to use more civilians in the Facilities/Fleet section of Support Services, Training Division of Support Services, at District Stations to support Captains, and in other support functions in the Operations Bureau.

Related Recommendations

The Controller's Office recommends SFPD establish the following to support civilianization efforts:

- Revise and re-certify minimum staffing.
- A policy providing criteria for when it is appropriate to use sworn or civilian personnel.
- Guidance documents to identify positions for accommodation or light-duty.

Reduce and Re-Certify Minimum Staffing

Based on this analysis, we recommend a revision of the mandated 1,971 sworn officers as minimum staffing to 1,666.[3] This revision should take place incrementally to comply with the Charter-specified stipulation that positions be converted as they are vacated by sworn officers and filled by civilians. Currently, the Controller's Office certifies that the minimum staffing level should be adjusted to 1,894 to reflect the 77 positions already civilianized.

---

[3] This number reflects 305 positions identified for civilianization. The discrepancy with the total in the summary table at the beginning of this memo represents the 23 positions identified for assistance with investigative duties. These positions would improve efficiencies rather than convert the work of sworn investigators to civilian positions. Because cases currently go unassigned, investigators, with civilian investigative aides, will take on more casework.

Establish Criteria for Deciding on Sworn or Civilian Personnel

For future functions in the Department to be assigned to civilian or sworn personnel, SFPD should develop specific questions or criteria in order to determine what type of position should be used. For example, Dallas has stated that "police department positions should be filled by civilians unless an affirmative case can be made that sworn officers are needed."

Ontario, Canada, New York City, Kansas City, and Dallas have all documented questions or criteria which indicate whether sworn personnel are necessary for the position. Some of these questions and criteria and the associated jurisdiction are:

- "Does the position involve law enforcement duties, including the power of arrest and the use of force?" (NYPD)
- "Is there a need for a firearm when carrying out the duties of the position?" (Ontario, Canada)
- "Does the position require a uniformed officer because of a statute or regulation?" (NYPD)
- Sworn activities include "maintenance of law and order" or "investigation of crimes" or "protection of life and property." (Kansas City)
- Is the "need for knowledge and perspective of sworn consistent and frequent?" (Dallas)

Develop Guidelines for Accommodation

As civilianization continues, it will be necessary for SFPD to consider how they will accommodate members that have been injured and need to be assigned light-duty work. SFPD must review what positions become vacant regularly or divisions that have project-based work that would easily accommodate light-duty officers. This review should then be turned into guidelines for staff to use in finding light-duty work for accommodated personnel.

Attachment A:
Time Spent on Calls for Service by Call Type
Estimate of Civilian Full-Time Equivalents

	Citizen-Initiated Reports			In-Station Reports			Cancelled Calls			Totals		
Type of Call	Number of Calls	Total Time Spent (in hours)	Full-Time Equivalent Required to Respond	Number of Calls	Total Time Spent (in hours)	Full-Time Equivalent Required to Respond	Number of Calls	Est. Total Time Spent (in hours)	Full-Time Equivalent Required to Respond	Total Number of Calls	Est. Total Time Spent (in hours)	Full-Time Equivalent Required to Respond
Burglary	3,869	7,301	4.21	3	5	0.00	67	181	0.10	**4,377**	**7,486**	**4.32**
Stolen vehicle	2,327	4,225	2.44	3	6	0.00	138	350	0.20	**2,885**	**4,581**	**2.64**
Petty theft	1,179	2,143	1.24	260	354	0.20	46	119	0.07	**1,653**	**2,617**	**1.51**
Fraud	840	1,604	0.93	2	5	0.00	27	72	0.04	**982**	**1,682**	**0.97**
Malicious mischief/vandalism	835	1,441	0.83	6	13	0.01	21	54	0.03	**944**	**1,508**	**0.87**
Threats	788	1,956	1.13	5	15	0.01	39	145	0.08	**927**	**2,116**	**1.22**
Auto boost/strip	469	595	0.34	10	10	0.01	15	24	0.01	**556**	**629**	**0.36**
Assault/battery	439	1,160	0.67	9	24	0.01	28	106	0.06	**544**	**1,290**	**0.74**
Grand theft	411	966	0.56	2	11	0.01	4	14	0.01	**474**	**992**	**0.57**
Interview a citizen	359	522	0.30	724	914	0.53	34	59	0.03	**1,179**	**1,495**	**0.86**
Stolen vehicle/wanted person	343	747	0.43	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	**401**	**747**	**0.43**
Malicious mischief/graffiti	254	435	0.25	5	12	0.01	6	15	0.01	**295**	**462**	**0.27**
Vehicle accident-no injury, hit and run	191	315	0.18	6	10	0.01	5	20	0.01	**139**	**346**	**0.20**
Strongarm robbery	92	219	0.13	1	2	0.00	5	17	0.01	**116**	**238**	**0.14**
Vehicle accident-no injury	71	113	0.07	4	7	0.00	6	11	0.01	**90**	**132**	**0.08**
Recovered stolen vehicle	57	118	0.07	n/a	n/a	n/a	12	33	0.02	**80**	**151**	**0.09**
Robbery	47	110	0.06	n/a	n/a	n/a	1	4	0.00	**53**	**114**	**0.07**
Broken window	32	32	0.02	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	**37**	**32**	**0.02**
Missing juvenile	29	52	0.03	n/a	n/a	n/a	6	15	0.01	**40**	**67**	**0.04**
Parking violation	15	10	0.01	n/a	n/a	n/a	20	17	0.01	**49**	**27**	**0.02**
Pursesnatch	22	50	0.03	n/a	n/a	n/a	1	4	0.00	**26**	**54**	**0.03**
Driveway violation	17	25	0.01	1	2	0.00	31	67	0.04	**53**	**94**	**0.05**
Alarm (audible or silent)	14	14	0.01	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a*	n/a*	n/a*	**16**	**14**	**0.01**
Missing person	16	28	0.02	n/a	n/a	n/a	3	8	0.00	**19**	**36**	**0.02**
Indecent exposure	10	25	0.01	n/a	n/a	n/a	1	3	0.00	**15**	**28**	**0.02**
Stabbing or cutting	11	40	0.02	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	**14**	**40**	**0.02**
Meet with a city/public service employee	13	24	0.01	3	8	0.00	n/a	n/a	n/a	**16**	**32**	**0.02**
Person dumping trash	11	11	0.01	n/a	n/a	n/a	2	3	0.00	**14**	**14**	**0.01**
Mentally disturbed person	7	11	0.01	n/a	n/a	n/a	6	13	0.01	**15**	**24**	**0.01**
Traffic congestion	7	6	0.00	n/a	n/a	n/a	6	8	0.00	**14**	**14**	**0.01**
Person breaking in	6	10	0.01	n/a	n/a	n/a	1	2	0.00	**8**	**12**	**0.01**
Person with a gun	5	14	0.01	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	**5**	**14**	**0.01**
Stolen property	4	11	0.01	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	**4**	**11**	**0.01**
Person with a knife	3	10	0.01	n/a	n/a	n/a	1	5	0.00	**4**	**15**	**0.01**
Tow truck	2	4	0.00	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	**2**	**4**	**0.00**
Abandoned vehicle	1	2	0.00	n/a	n/a	n/a	1	3	0.00	**2**	**4**	**0.00**
Unknown type of complaint	n/a	n/a	n/a	680	1,113	0.64	n/a	n/a	n/a	**680**	**1,113**	**0.64**
Suspicious person	n/a	n/a	n/a	22	38	0.02	n/a	n/a	n/a	**22**	**38**	**0.02**
Suspicious person in a vehicle	n/a	n/a	n/a	6	11	0.01	n/a	n/a	n/a	**6**	**11**	**0.01**
Vehicle accident-injury	n/a	n/a	n/a	2	4	0.00	n/a	n/a	n/a	**2**	**4**	**0.00**
Aided case	n/a	n/a	n/a	1	2	0.00	n/a	n/a	n/a	**1**	**2**	**0.00**
Noise complaint/disturbing the peace	n/a	n/a	n/a	1	3	0.00	n/a	n/a	n/a	**1**	**3**	**0.00**
Grand Total	**12,796**	**24,349**	**14.05**	**1,756**	**2,570**	**1.48**	**533**	**1,374**	**0.79**	**15,085**	**28,293**	**16.32**

Source: Department of Emergency Management Computer Aided Dispatch; Analysis by Controller's Office, City Services Auditor Division

*Cancelled alarm calls were removed from the cancelled calls analysis because it is likely that these are alarm companies calling back and reporting a false alarm

Attachment B:
Average Wait Times for Citizen-Initiated Calls for Service by Call Type Eligible for Civilian Response

Call Type	Average Wait Time (in minutes)	Number Included in Average
Abandoned vehicle	116	1
Stabbing or cutting	95	10
Parking violation	81	12
Robbery	66	44
Fraud	65	839
Malicious mischief/graffiti	64	257
Stolen vehicle/wanted person	64	339
Tow truck	63	2
Grand theft	61	413
Recovered stolen vehicle	60	56
Threats	58	784
Burglary	57	3,863
Assault/battery	57	444
Person dumping trash	57	11
Malicious mischief/vandalism	53	836
Pursesnatch	49	22
Person with a knife	48	3
Strongarm robbery	48	92
Petty theft	48	1,427
Stolen vehicle	47	2,317
Missing juvenile	46	29
Auto boost/strip	46	474
Driveway violation	46	18
Vehicle accident-no injury	46	191
Person with a gun	44	4
Alarm (audible or silent)	43	14
Broken window	42	32
Missing person	36	16
Meet with a city/public service employee	35	15
Mentally disturbed person	32	6
Stolen property	30	4
Indecent exposure	27	10
Person breaking in	18	6
Traffic congestion	18	5
Interview a citizen	17	1,069
Noise complaint/disturbing the peace	0	1

Source: Department of Emergency Management Computer Aided Dispatch; Analysis by Controller's Office, City Services Auditor Division.

Attachment C:
Summary of Civilianized and Recommended Positions

		Patrol and Investigations Recommendations				Support Functions: Previous Civilianization and Recommended Hiring Efforts								
		Patrol Recommendations		Investigations Recommendations		Previous Civilianization Efforts					Current Civilianization Recommendations			
reau	Division	Number Recommended	Functions	Number Recommended	Functions	Number Recommended	Number Hired	Number Not Funded	Number De-Authorized in FY09-10 ASO	Functions	Number Recommended from Previous Civilianization Identification*	Functions	Number Newly Recommended	Functions
	Investigations	n/a	n/a	13	Civilian personnel to conduct investigative tasks that do not require sworn status, such as preparing case files, scheduling interviews, and conducting research on incident and criminal codes	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
perations	District Stations	16	Community Police Services Aides to relieve sworn personnel from responding to non-hazardous, time-consuming calls for service.	10	Civilian personnel to conduct investigative tasks at Distinct Stations that do not require sworn status, such as preparing case files, scheduling interviews, and conducting research on incident and criminal codes.	50	44	6	0	Police Services Aides; Auto Service Workers, Buildings and Grounds supervisor at HOJ (transferred to SHF).	n/a	n/a	96	Captain Staff: Sworn personnel performing some or all of the following functions – permits, facility maintenance, subpoenas, and special event tracking should be civilianized. (37 positions) CompStat Prep: Sworn personnel are providing analytical support to Captains by compiling quantitave and qualitative data for CompStat (14 positions) Custody Service Aide: Sworn personnel are performing minimal duties in the detention of suspects (45 positions).
	Homeland Security	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	2	0	0	2	Stable Attendants	2	Stable Attendants	n/a	n/a
	Other	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	5	Tow hearing officers (4 positions), officer in Graffiti Abatement Unit (1 position).
	Subtotal	16	n/a	23	n/a	52	44	6	2	n/a	2	n/a	101	n/a
	CompStat	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	9	Crime, business, and administrative analysts to conduct various analyses in support of CompStat.
	Forensic Services	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	3	0	1	2	Photographer for the photo lab and positions assisting with legal suits and claims	3	Photographer for the photo lab and positions assisting with legal suits and claims.	25	Criminalists; crime scene investigators (to collect/analyze weapons, visual, biological, digital and other evidence).
	Staff Services	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	2	1	1	0	Industrial injury investigator and manager of staff services.	1	For follow-up (Industrial injury investigator)	n/a	n/a
Administrative Services	Support Services	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	41	16	4	21	Hired: Chief Clerk for Records; Clerk/typists for Records and other Support Services; Storekeepers in Property Control; Auto Service Worker in Facilities/Fleet; and Civilian Manager of Support Services. Unfunded/De-authorized: Clerks for Records; Fleet manager; stationary engineer in planning; Clerk/typists in ID and Permits; Auto Service Workers in Fleet	12	Clerks for Records (other positions not included, follow-up)'	26	Permits: Unit processes fees, and issues and maintains 55 different types of permits for nearly 1000 venues, conducts noise tests, makes recommendations to the Entertainment Cmsn (5 positions). Facilities/Fleet: Coordinates facility repairs, coordinates maintenance and repair of SFPD fleet; devises specs for vehicle purchases (3 positions). Property: Receives, stores, and maintains all evidence and found property (18 positions).
	Technology	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	12	8	1	3	Information Systems Engineers, Managers, and Administrators; Business Analyst; Chief Information Officer	1	Web site editor	17	Information Systems Engineers, Managers, and Administrators; Business Analysts
	Training	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	1	1	0	0	Management Assistant	n/a	n/a	5	Clerical duties and to assist with professional development of civilian members of the Department: 2 clerk or assistant positions, 2 training coordinator positions, and 1 audio/visual technician.
	Subtotal	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	59	26	7	26	n/a	17	n/a	82	
Chief of Staff	Risk Management	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	8	4	0	4	Attorneys; Legal Process Clerk; Clerk Typists; Legal Assistants	4	Clerk Typist; positions that respond to PRA and OCC requests (Legal Process Clerk); Court liaison and position shared with MCD and Legal (Legal Assistants).	5	Research, writing, and support work for civil claims and lawsuits and developing and reviewing written directives. Attorneys, legal process clerks, legal assistants, and legal secretaries could fill these positions.
	Fiscal	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	4	3	1	0	Chief Financial Officer; Analyst; Grants Manager, Grants position	1	Civilianization of grant unit position	0	Once grants position is filled, this unit is fully civilianized.
	Subtotal	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	12	7	1	4	n/a	5	n/a	5	n/a
Total		16	n/a	23^	n/a	123	77	14	32	n/a	24	n/a	188	n/a

*If not carried forward from previous recommendations, the position no longer exists or function has been moved to a different division/person or hired into a different position to cover the work.
^Investigations positions are not included in the recommended adjustment